Job Satisfaction and Organizational Commitment of Private College Teachers in Pakistan

Nabeeha Zulfiqar¹ and Zafarullah Shaker²

Abstract

In this qualitative study, researchers conducted research to explore the job satisfaction of private colleges' teachers either they are exultant and satisfied with their jobs or not. A sample of five teachers, two students and two principles has been taken for conducting interviews from two cities of Pakistan, Lahore and Faisalabad. Ultimate purpose of this study is to know about the job satisfaction of teachers working in private college, which elements affect their job satisfaction. This study used Maslow's Need Hierarchy theory and try to link factor of job satisfaction with this theory. This study explored that most of the teachers could not fulfil their basic need (physiological need) then it is difficult for them to fulfil the next needs. So for the job satisfaction of private college teacher, preference should be given to fulfil their physiological needs along with other needs which are also indispensable. This study concluded that private colleges are not fulfilling physiological needs of teachers. If teachers are not satisfied with their job then they will not provide effective input in their work which will effect students' result performance and their loyalty and dedication will reduced. If the teachers are satisfied then they will effectively contribute to conveying knowledge, improvement of skills and talents that will lead to overall growth and progress of students and for the well-being of community. Due to time constraints, only two colleges were selected and from these colleges not all the teachers were interviewed in this study.

Keywords: Self-Actualization, Self-Esteem, Affiliation, Safety Needs, Physiological Needs.

1. Introduction

Education is most significant, formal and useful component for the development of any nation. Teacher is the fundamental element in educational system and is known as a nation builder. In the knowledge journey, teacher is the prime source and has key role for delivering quality education to students and their character building. Teaching profession is known as most respectful profession in the world.

Job satisfaction is an important element in every job like private or government sectors. Maslow's needs hierarchy theory was the first theory and mostly used (Ahmed, 2012; Benson & Dundis, 2003; Jerome, 2013) which give importance to employee job satisfaction. This theory states that human needs form a five levels hierarchy on the basis of importance of each one level. According to this theory if one need is fulfilled then the employee will be motivated and satisfied with his/hers job. In the figure,

¹School of Accounting and Finance, Faculty of Management Studies, University of Central Punjab Lahore, Pakistan. beehabajwa@gmail.com
²School of Accounting and Finance, Faculty of Management Studies, University of Central Punjab Lahore, Pakistan. zafarullahshaker@gmail.com
direction of arrow below shows from most basic needs to least important needs (EK & Mukuru, 2013).

**Figure 1: Maslow’s Need Hierarchy Theory**

In current era, teachers are facing many problems like increasing teacher attrition rate and extra work burden relating to their job satisfaction. Many researcher exposed that increasing teacher attrition rate had become a major problem in whole world (Chang, 2009; Hong, 2010). Unnecessary workload has found a major reason in teachers to left the teaching profession (Skaalvik & Skaalvik, Teacher job satisfaction and motivation to leave the teaching profession:Relations with school context, feeling of belonging, and emotional exhaustion, 2011). Teachers who were planning to quit the profession reported less satisfied and more adverse attitude toward teaching as a profession (Smith, 2007).

It is more important to give more attention to know that how teaching environment and working condition affect the teachers in private colleges. Compassionate working environment is positively linked to satisfaction and to stay in teaching profession (Skaalvik & Skaalvik, Teacher job satisfaction and motivation to leave the teaching profession:Relations with school context, feeling of belonging, and emotional exhaustion, 2011). Teacher autonomy is known as a major element for teacher job satisfaction level (Zembylas & Papanastasiou, 2006). Other studies stated that self-efficiency is also linked with higher job satisfaction (Klassen & Chiu, 2010).
The career success of students are mostly depend upon teachers. A satisfied teacher is not just effect on students' academic progress as well as throughout their lives in their bright future career development (Chetty, Fridman, & Rockoff, 2014). If teachers are satisfied with their job then students will get desired level of knowledge (Kapur, 2018).

If teachers are not satisfied they will not deliver required level of teaching. If the teachers are satisfied then they will effectively contribute to conveying knowledge, improvement of skills and talents that will lead to overall growth and progress of students and for the well-being of community (Kapur, 2018).

Thus, the purpose of this study is to know about the job satisfaction of teachers working at private colleges in Pakistan, which elements affect their job satisfaction and if there is dissatisfaction exists then what consequences students have to face.

1.1 Problem Statement

It is seemed that private college teachers are less satisfied with their job. Teachers’ devotedness and efficiency exclusively depend upon self-esteem, motivation and their job satisfaction (Shann, 2001). There may be many reasons for dissatisfaction in private college teachers like low salary packages, more demanding hours of work, behaviour of college administration, technology, equipment and incentives (Kapur, 2018). If teachers are not satisfied they will not deliver required level of teaching. If the teachers are satisfied then they will effectively contribute to conveying knowledge, improvement of skills and talents that will lead to overall growth and progress of students and for the well-being of community (Kapur, 2018). If teachers are satisfied with their job, they will perform well and can build a sense of growth, development opportunities to their students and good grades (Vito, Brown, Bannister, Cianci, & Mujtaba, 2016)

1.2 Research Questions

1. Which elements effects private colleges’ teacher job satisfaction?
2. What are the consequences of teacher job dissatisfaction?
3. Is private college teacher job dissatisfaction affect students?

2. Literature Review

Job satisfaction is very important for any organization or institution, as if employees are satisfied with their job they will create benefits for the organization but if not then they can create problems in their work environment (Fuming & Jiliang, 2007).

Education is considered as important element for the development of a country. Teacher are the backbone of education system. Many researcher exposed that increasing teacher attrition rate had become a major problem in whole world (Chang, 2009; Hong, 2010). Teacher job satisfaction is very important because it has straight impact on the future generation like students. Adams, 2010 revealed that satisfied teachers will provide a good education system. Another study stated that if teachers are satisfied with their job then they will have lower level of stress, anxiety and burnout and will have highly enthused behaviour (Caprara, Barbaranelli, Steca, & Malone, 2006).

It is seemed that teacher job satisfaction can be affected due to leadership style of the principal (Bogler, 2001). Literature also showed that lack of administration’s support
and not included in decision making events are the reasons of job dissatisfaction and increase in teacher's turnover (Boyd, Grossman, Ing, Lankford, & Wychoff, 2009).

It is seemed that if teacher are included in decision making activities it creates a sense of commitment which help in achieving ultimate goals of educational institutions (Hulpia, Gevos, & Keer, 2009). Supportive environment at institutions and good relations with parents, other teachers and administration are also caused teacher's job satisfaction (Scheopner, 2010).

If an employee is motivated then he will be more satisfied with his job and any employee is less motivated then this may leads to dissatisfaction (Ivancevich, JM, R, & MT, 2014). Job satisfaction is recognised as supposed association between what one craving from his job & what he identifies it as offering (Lund, 2003). Job satisfaction is the association of feelings with the job which is necessary for good work place (Jones & George, 2003).

In this study, Maslow’s Need Hierarchy theory has been used. Maslow’s theory (1943) is widely used to know about job satisfaction of employees (Vito, Brown, Bannister, Cianci, & Mujtaba, 2016: Shahrawat & Shahrawat, 2017). This theory is based on five essential needs like physiological needs, security and safety needs, affiliation needs, self-esteem needs and self-actualization needs. As per Maslow’s need Hierarchy theory, physiological needs include salary, shelter, food and clothing. Safety and security needs include secure work environment and job security. Third level of need is affiliation need which include accepted, being loved and part of work environment. As Maslow’s need theory, four need is self-esteem need which based on respect and recognition. Last need is self-actualization which is based on high knowledge and experience, devoted with same job and motivational environment (Ahmed, 2012).

The past literature shows a further study gap which need to fill in this study that the job satisfaction of private college teachers of the same institutes in two different cities (Faisalabad, Lahore) campuses have to be considered through coding method. How differ their job satisfaction level with each other, which elements affect their job satisfaction and if there exist job dissatisfaction then which consequences effect on students of Punjab, Pakistan.

2.1 Hypothesis
\(H_1\): Job dissatisfaction of private college teachers have significant impact on their job loyalty.
\(H_2\): Job dissatisfaction of private college teachers have significant impact on their students’ grades.
\(H_3\): Job dissatisfaction of private college teachers have significant impact college reputation and progress.

3. Methodology
Before getting into colleges, we firstly pre-test our questionnaire to insure that is it making sense to respondent and researcher. The results of pre-testing were enough to get required information and there was no need of further modifications in questionnaire. So the questionnaire was finalised to conduct interviews.
For this study, a group contained of two researchers. Before conducting interviews from all the respondents, written consent for audio recording and voluntary contribution has been taken. Those consents were signed and stamped by the teacher and authorised person of respective college. The reason for written consent was that they could not sue researchers in future relating to any confidential issues.

While visiting private college in Lahore for conducting interviews, we both of the researchers participate. One of the researcher was asking questions from the respondents and the other one taking notes and audio record interviews. Those recordings were shared with other researcher. In college of Faisalabad, one researcher went to college for conducting interviews because it was convenient for him to get in. But the second for author, it was not possible for her to visit out of city. One researcher held the interviews and record it and after that those recordings were share with other researcher for her work.

All these interviews are transcribed separately on different location with our best understanding. 1st order coding was done separately and after that 2nd order coding was done by mutual consultation. Three teachers, one student and a principal in first college and two teachers, one student and principal from second college were the participants of our study. Every teacher who is the participant of our study is permanent facility members. Written consent from each of participants is taken before his/her participation.

Semi-structured interviews were conducted for data collection (Skaalvik & Skaalvik, Job satisfaction, stress and coping strategies in the teaching profession—What do teachers say?, 2015; Diefenbach, 2009; DiCicco-Bloom & Crabtree, 2006). Semi-structured interviews are flexible in order of questions, some new questions can be asked apart from set questions to confirm answers of interviewer and some question can be deleted as well. All the interviews are contained three sections. First one was demography questions like name, age, experience and major qualifications. Second was essential questions which are to be asked from everyone, follow up questions to check clarity and some extra questions to evaluate reliability of responses. Third and last one was throw-away questions which include used to develop rapport, keeping participant busy and redirect away from problems where things getting troubled.

This study is about teacher’s job satisfaction, so more emphasis is given to teachers’ interview. Number of questions in teacher interviews are much higher as compared to other participants of this study. Each interview of teacher contained about 20-25 minutes. All the interviews were audio recorded and transcribed later.

During data collection, we faced different problems. Like in Faisalabad, when researcher visited 1st college first time, the principal of college do not agree to give him access to their teachers and other staff. He spent about 1 hour to connivance him and show all the study documents and also gave guarantee that no information is to be disclosed by name. After written guarantee of the authors, he agreed and arranged meetings with his staff.

In Lahore private college, when we visited college jointly, the gate keeper did not allow to enter into college as he argued that no visitors are to be allowed during college timings. When we insisted to just make a call to principal for a meeting then he agreed and the college admin allowed us to get in. When we discussed with the admin about our study, he straightforwardly refused by saying that we belong to his competitor
institution. After half hour discussion, he just agreed that he will first talk to his regional officer then we can make interviews. He gave us one week time for this process. After one week when we called him, he just refused by saying that his regional officer did not allow us to conduct study in their college. We tried a lot but useless.

After refusal of second college, we selected another private college from Lahore. Here we have a reference and take time from college admin for our visit. When we went to college for conducting interviews, we met to college admin, he asked many quarries about this research like why we want to conduct their staff interview, what types of questions are to be asked. College admin asked us to give him a copy of interview questionnaire for review before conducting interview. After reviewing questionnaire, he allowed us to conduct interviews.

3.1 Analysis

This is a qualitative study so an interpretive technique is being used in this study (Gioia D. A., Thomas, Clark, & Chittipeddi, 1994). As per this approach we explored information from the participants and tried to interpret it without giving importance to previous views as in literature. In this study we just strained interpretation as per the information got from the respondents.

During the interviews, one researcher asked the questions from the interviewee and the other researcher made audio recording and note down the keywords of answers as per questions. All the interviews were recorded and shared with other researcher. All the interviews were transcribed by each researcher separately.

Each interviews is listened again and again after transcribe for clarity. Then the next process, 1st order coding, is done by each researcher. In 1st order coding we just picked up some categories from literature and then link to these categories with transcribe data of the interviews individually. After doing 1st order coding separately then we sited together and matched over 1st order coding in which some of results were similar but in some there was a conflict so then after mutual consideration and discussion we finalize some categories which were used for second order coding. In second order coding, we used needs of Maslow’s Need Hierarchy theory. Then we linked the first order finalized categories with Maslow’s Need Hierarchy theory and developed construct.

When we discussed about all the categories we made and patterns which have been drawn, about 60percent-70percent of our work was same which we did separately. There was an issue in category of accepted and being loved, one researcher did not consider it. There was another conflict between both authors relating to categories of promotional opportunity and re-choose same career. After mutual consultation this conflict has been removed. One researcher club two categories like financial needs and other financial benefits while other researcher took these two categories separately and after discussion this matter was resolved.
4. Discussion/Findings

This study explored that if the different levels of needs were fulfilled then the level of satisfaction will be increased. As per Maslow’s Need Hierarchy theory physiological needs are like pay, food, shelter and clothing. Out of five teacher respondents, three (respondent 1, 2 & 5) were extremely satisfied by saying that “we are satisfied with the current pay determination system” which means that physiological need is fulfilled by their job. But at the same time two teacher respondent (3 & 4) said that “current pay is not fulfilling their financial needs” so that is the reason they also move to another institutions for fulfilling their financial needs. Meanwhile according to the principal respondent 6 said that “one or two teachers have left college since last year for better pay package” on the other side principal respondent 7 said that “about 8 to 10 teachers left college since last year due to insufficient pay package as some universities are paying them more rather than private colleges because private colleges have low budget by having lesser number of students as compared to universities which have higher budgets by having larger number of students so that is the reason teacher left private colleges and switched to other institutions”. Hence as above comments inference that private colleges are not fulfilling physiological needs of Maslow’s Need Hierarchy theory which is the basic part of job satisfaction (Broeck, Vansteenkiste, Witte, & Lens, 2008).

Second need of Maslow’s Need Hierarchy theory is safety (security) need. All the teacher respondents (1, 2, 3, 4&5) said that “college environment is good, secure and healthy and up-to the safety measures”. Principal respondents (6 & 7) said that “they provide good environment to their teachers and students”. Teacher respondent 5 said that “he is committed with his job, fulltime available, loyal with this college and considered as in the good books of college”. These are the strengths which leads to my job security. If there is job security there will be job satisfaction (Lee, Back, & Chan, 2015).

Being loved, accepted and part of grouped is considered as third need of Maslow’s Need Hierarchy as Affiliation need which is the part of job satisfaction. Both of student respondent 8&9 are satisfied with their teachers and they respect and like their teachers. All teacher respondents (1, 2, 3, 4 and 5) said that “mostly their students like them, colleague’s respect them and college administration also give required respect”. According to student respondents 8 & 9 views that “they like their teacher’s way of teaching and the way how they treat their students during class”. Principal respondent 6 stated that “if teacher could not convey required knowledge up-to the mark to students then students have a right to share their quarries with senior administration so that it could be sorted out as soon as possible by consulting with teachers”.

Fourth need of Maslow’s Need Hierarchy Need theory is self-esteem which may include promotional opportunities and respect/recognition. Teacher respondent 1, 2 & 4 stated that “promotion opportunities lagged by fixed/contractual agreement and also based on teacher’s teaching style, student’s good result performance and practical experience in teaching profession”.

Last need of Maslow’s Need Hierarchy Need theory is self-actualization need which comes on the last of pyramid on the Maslow’s need theory. This need is based on high knowledge and experience, devoted with same job and motivational environment. One of the teacher respondent 4 said that “this college is a source of enhancing knowledge.
for me so I will continue to gain knowledge and experience from current college and then move toward for Doctorate and switch to university as professor”.

5. Limitations
Job satisfaction is very important element for any organization which cannot be judged at once. As in qualitative study, detailed knowledge is required to explore new things. But due to time constraints, only two colleges were selected and from these colleges not all the teachers were interviewed in this study. This study is conducted in only two cities of Punjab. Only one student from each college was selected for interview. It is recommended for future researchers that more number of colleges can be selected. All the teachers should be interviewed from each college. Colleges can be selected from other provinces of Pakistan for the clarity of results. There should also maximum number of students who can be interview for dense data.

6. Practical Implication
Job satisfaction is very important element in every field of work. If employees are satisfied with their job, they can perform well. Employee job satisfaction is important for institutions/business and as well as for the society well beings. Employees who are not satisfied with their job, their productivity and affectivity will be decreased. Now a days, teachers are facing problem of lack of job satisfaction especially in private sector. This study can help to the institutions of Pakistan in private sector to know the reasons of lack of job satisfaction and its impacts on students and society. Institutions can get help from this study and know the reasons of dissatisfaction and then can try to overcome those reasons.

7. Conclusion
As per above all discussion, it is cleared that if the teachers are satisfied with their job, this will have positive impact on students. This study concluded that private colleges are not fulfilling physiological needs of teachers like up to standard pay determination system, mostly not providing other financial benefits like transport facility, health and medical insurance which are the elements of basic Maslow’s Need Hierarchy theory for their job satisfaction (Broeck, Vansteenkiste, Witte, & Lens, 2008). If teachers are not satisfied with their job then they will not provide effective input in their work which will effect on students’ result performance and their loyalty and deduction power be will reduced. On the other hand, if the teachers are satisfied then they will effectively contribute to conveying knowledge, improvement of skills and talents that will lead to overall growth and progress of students and for the well-being of community (Kapur, 2018). As well as it also effect on the overall student’s result, college reputation and progress. So, here the above alternative hypothesis are accepted while null hypothesis rejected .There are levels of needs in this theory according to which if one need is fulfilled then individual try to fulfill the next one. In our study, most of the teachers could not fulfil their basic need (physiological need) then the other needs how can justify this basic one. So for the job satisfaction of private college teacher, preference should be given to fulfil their physiological needs along with other needs (Broeck, Vansteenkiste, Witte, & Lens, 2008).
References
Appendix

Interview consent
Research Title: Job satisfaction and organizational commitment of private college teachers in Pakistan. This written consent is necessary for us to ensure that you understand the purpose of your involvement and that you are agree to the conditions of your participation.

Kindly read all the statements below carefully:
- Your participation in this study is voluntary
- You have the right to withdraw at any time without giving any reason
- This interview may take about 20 to 25 minutes
- You do not have to expect to receive any benefit or payment for your participation
- You have the right not to answer any particular question, you are free to refuse
- Your responses will be kept strictly confidential
- Your name will not be used in the research material
- Your valuable data will be kept for future research purposes like publications of this study

If you are agree to take part in this interview please sign below as it will be considered your written consent for interview

Participant Name: __________________________
Participant Sign: __________
Researcher Signature: ______________________
Date: ___________________

Note: If you are worried about this research or if you are concerned about how it is being conducted, you may contact to our research supervisor Dr. Hassan Imam, SAF, Faculty of Management Studies, University of Central Punjab.

Interview Questions

Teacher
1. What is your full name sir?
2. What is your age?
3. Are you working here full time or part time?
4. Apart from this job, are you doing part job somewhere?
5. What is your highest qualification?
6. How long have you been working as a teacher?
7. How long you have been working with your current institute?
8. If you had the opportunity to start over in a new career, which career you would choose? And why?
9. Generally speaking, do you believe that the teachers with whom you work are motivated?
10. Do you feel that pay determination system is good in your college?
11. What kind of factors are considered for promotion in your colleges?
12. What kind of supervision is there in your college?
13. Are you feeling comfortable with environment in your college?
14. How many hours do you work or teach here?
15. Does your college have any other financial benefits for teachers except pay?
16. Is there any welfare program (Loan, marriage assistance incentive, medical facility, EOBI contribution etc.) for teacher in your college?
17. Is there any transportation facility provided by college to you?
18. What do you say about the health and safety measures of this college?
19. Which kind of job security your college is providing to you as compare to other private colleges?
20. Are you happy from the respect you receiving from your college?
21. What do you think that pay package this institute is offering you meet your financial requirements?
22. Which kind of increment system in your college? Performance based or fixed?
23. Are you happy with the existing pay increment system?
24. How do you see the behaviour and respect element of your students to you?

College Principal
1. What is your full name sir?
2. What's your age?
3. What is your highest qualification?
4. For how long you have been serving as principal?
5. Were you directly appointed as principal or promoted as principal?
6. Since how long you hold your current position?
7. Is your staff co-operative?
8. What's your view about the existing teachers' style of teaching?
9. What's your view about the motivation of teachers?
10. Do you feel that your teachers are well motivated for teaching?
11. Do you think that there is any correlation between teachers or style of teaching and increase in student enrolment?
12. Which kind of complaints you get from students?
13. Is there any complaint related to teachers or style of teaching from student side?
14. Do you think behaviour of your teachers are up to the mark with your students?
15. Can you give us a rough estimate that how many teachers have left your college since last year?
16. Do you think they left due to pay packages?

College student
1. What is your full name?
2. In which class you are enrolled?
3. What is your study area?
4. Since how long you are in this college?
5. How you know about this college?
6. Why you got admission in this college?
7. What is the difference you feel in your college and other colleges?
8. Are your teachers had a thorough knowledge relating to your subjects?
9. Do your teachers respect your ideas?
10. Are your teachers provide opportunities or encourage to ask questions?
11. Do your teachers make the subject as interesting as possible?
12. Are you satisfied with the behaviour of your teachers?
13. Are you satisfied with the grading system of your teacher?
14. Do you feel your teachers help you in your career building?
15. Are you recommend your sibling and friends to get admission in this college?